

“A Wholesome Verdict:”

Using Historical Empathy Strategies to Analyze Elizabeth Jennings v. The Third Avenue Railway Company

Katherine Perrotta

On a hot July day in 1854, 24-year-old school-teacher Elizabeth Jennings, accompanied by a friend, attempted to board a horse-drawn trolley to attend Sunday church services in Lower Manhattan. The Irish conductor refused, telling Jennings, who was African American, to await a horsecar for “her people.”¹ When Jennings resisted, the conductor and a nearby police officer physically ejected her. Elizabeth Jennings reported her ordeal to her father, prominent entrepreneur and abolitionist Thomas L. Jennings, and to her church congregation. Her testimony was published in local newspapers, where she stated that the conductor “took hold of me and I took hold of the window sash and held on; he pulled me until he broke my grasp.... I screamed murder with all my voice.”² The conductor “tauntingly” told Elizabeth to get “redress” if she could.³ So she did.

Thomas Jennings appealed to the Legal Rights Association, of which he was a co-founder, to raise funds for representation. Future U.S. President Chester A. Arthur, of the firm Culver, Parker, and Arthur, signed on as Elizabeth Jennings’s attorney against the Third Avenue Railway Company. In the New York Supreme Court, in February 1855, Arthur argued that the Third Avenue Railway Company violated Elizabeth Jennings’s “common carrier rights,” which stipulated that transportation conveyances were “bound to carry all persons if sober, well-behaved, and free from disease, [and]

had the same rights as others; and could neither be excluded.”⁴ The judge instructed the jury that the company was liable “for the acts of their agents,” and the jury awarded Jennings a \$250 settlement (half of what she sued for).⁵ As a result, the Third Avenue Railway Company, as well as other trolley companies in New York City, reversed their segregation ordinances.

Elizabeth Jennings’s story is a powerful example of activism for racial equality in antebellum America, yet there was barely a “thumbnail sketch” about her in history books, noted African American historian John H. Hewitt.⁶ Thirty years after Hewitt wrote about Jennings, contemporary scholars, authors, and educators are finally taking notice of her role as a nineteenth-century civil rights figure. This overdue attention is encouraging because many historical narratives often focus on extraordinary civil rights figures with little attention to the actions of ordinary citizens such as Elizabeth Jennings. These lesser-known historical narratives can serve as powerful tools for engaging students in historical empathy.⁷

Historical Empathy

Historical empathy refers to the process in which students examine primary and secondary sources to (1) identify historical contexts, (2) explain the perspectives of historical figures, and (3) make affective connections to historical content while



Courtesy of Kansas State Historical Society

evaluating how the past and present differ.⁸ Historical empathy is not simply the act of students imagining what life was like in the past. Moreover, historical empathy is not encouraging sympathy for people and groups who committed terrible acts, nor does it involve presentism with regard to understanding the past based solely on today's terms. Rather, historical empathy involves both cognitive and emotive acts in which students analyze documents to determine how the past and present differ, how historical context impacted the perspectives of people in the past, and why examining the role of ordinary citizens such as Elizabeth Jennings is significant, by making relevant connections to experiential knowledge and civic life.

To promote historical empathy, teachers should explore frameworks that emphasize inquiry of historical contexts and perspectives through primary and secondary source analysis. For example, Colby's Historical Narrative Inquiry Model is a five-step process of implementing historical empathy strategies that involve students' (1) activation of prior knowledge, (2) reading secondary sources to establish historical context, (3) analyzing primary sources to gain perspectives of past people, (4) displaying findings from primary and secondary source analysis, and (5) debriefing what was learned, inquiring about additional questions, and discussing connections to experiential knowledge or the experiences of others.⁹

Similarly, the inquiry arc of the College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework supports the inquiry process of fostering historical empathy by (1) developing questions and planning inquiries, (2) applying disciplinary tools and concepts from the social studies content areas (civics, history, geography, economics), (3) evaluating sources and using evidence, and (4) communicating conclusions and taking informed action.¹⁰ I align Colby's five-steps with the C3 Inquiry Arc by underscoring the process of activating prior knowledge, providing multiple primary and secondary sources, and designing learning activities that drive inquiry of the compelling question—the big idea and essential understandings of the role ordinary citizens such as Jennings played in the struggle for equality in United States history.

To assess the affective aspects of historical empathy, I adapted Lee and Shemilt's five-level

framework because their rubric provides a range through which to measure student demonstration of historical empathy.¹¹ Since completing my dissertation, I updated this rubric to better align with the C3 Framework Inquiry Arc and to measure cognitive and affective elements.¹² The five-level framework rubric includes:

Level 1. Students view the past as inferior and resort to stereotypes. Primary and secondary sources are not used to understand historical contexts or to make relevant affective connections to content;

Level 2. Students use some primary and secondary sources to make generalizations about historical context and perspectives and make vague affective connections to content;

Level 3. Students use primary and secondary sources to identify historical perspectives and contexts with some explanation of how the past and present differ, and provide some relevant affective connections to content;

Level 4. Students use primary- and secondary-source evidence to explain how people in the past made decisions based upon the times they lived; describe how the past and present differ without a presentist lens; make several affective connections to content;

Level 5. Students demonstrate all criteria in the previous level, plus explain how they can take informed action about an issue in the present.

Learning Activities

The following activities, which can be adapted for varying grade levels, are designed to be carried out over several class periods. They are modeled on the Inquiry Design Model Blueprint, with questions, tasks, and source analysis focused on *Elizabeth Jennings v. Third Avenue Railway Company*.¹³

Big Idea: Equality

Compelling Question: Is it ever O.K. to break a rule or law?

Essential Understandings: Ordinary citizens played integral roles in challenging laws and rules in order to gain civil rights and equality throughout United States history.

Learning Activity #1: Activating Prior Knowledge and Setting the Stage

Teachers will set the stage by asking students to brainstorm definitions of “civil rights” and “equality.” Next, ask students: “Can ordinary citizens play a role in civil rights movements? If so, how? If not, why?” Invite students to deliberate why some people are famous historical figures while others are not. After this discussion, ask students whether or not they have heard of Elizabeth Jennings; if they have, students can discuss Jennings’s role in the civil rights movement; if they have not, students can discuss who they think she was and what role she may have played in the struggles for equality. These questions can establish a foundation for students to examine how ordinary citizens like Elizabeth Jennings played important roles in resisting racial discrimination throughout U.S. history.

Learning Activity #2: Secondary Source Analysis

Next, invite students to read secondary sources that will establish their understanding of the historical context in which Elizabeth Jennings lived. Laura Sassi’s “Elizabeth Jennings Takes a Stand,” in *Highlights Magazine* and Beth Anderson’s book *Lizzie Demands a Seat* (Calkins Creek, 2004) help younger students get a sense of life in the United States, particularly New York City, during the 1850s. Amy Hill Hearth’s *Streetcar to Justice* (Greenwillow Books, 2018) provides a more detailed biography of Jennings and includes socio-economic and political factors appropriate for upper elementary and middle school students. Jerry Mikorenda’s book *America’s First Freedom Rider* (Lyons Press, 2020) will help high school students analyze the biographies of Jennings and Chester A. Arthur, and the contexts in which they lived. Provide students with graphic organizers to read and record pertinent information from these secondary sources.

Sample Graphic Organizer for Learning Activity # 2

Directions: List the author, title, and date of the secondary sources about Elizabeth Jennings. Read the text and complete the chart. Answer the reflection questions in at least one complete sentence.

Author(s), title, date	Where and When did the Events Take Place?	Who are the Main People and Events Highlighted?	What is the Point of View of the Author(s)?	What kind of Evidence did the Author(s) provide?

Reflection: Answer each question in at least one complete sentence.

1. What information from the text gave you insight into the historical context at the time of the Jennings ejection and lawsuit?
2. What information gave you insight into the perspectives of people involved at the time?
3. After reading the text, do you think it is ever O.K. to break a rule or a law? Explain.

Learning Activity #3: Primary Source Analysis

Have students analyze document-based questions about Elizabeth Jennings's trolley expulsion and subsequent court case to gain insights into the perspectives of those involved. *The New York Daily Tribune*, *The Brooklyn Daily Eagle*, *The Pacific Appeal*, and *Frederick Douglass' Paper* were among the prominent newspapers that reported on Jennings's case. Have students read the newspaper excerpts that focus specifically on the published accounts of Jennings's testimony, the court proceedings, and editorial responses to her verdict. After students read these documents, have them complete a graphic organizer to record information that explains the contexts and perspectives of those involved.

Directions: Using information from the following documents, and complete the chart.

Document #1: Excerpt, "Outrage Upon Colored Persons," *New York Daily Tribune*, July 19, 1854, 7:2. The Library of Congress Chronicling America Newspaper Archive: <http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn83030213/1854-07-19/ed-1/seq-7.pdf>

Document #2: "Court Record, Circuit Court Before Judge Rockwell," *The Brooklyn Daily Eagle*, February 23, 1855. The Brooklyn Public Library Digital Archive, <https://bklyn.newspapers.com/image/50244622/?terms=Elizabeth%2Bjennings>

Document #3: "A Wholesome Verdict," *New York Daily Tribune*, February 23, 1855, 7:4. The Library of Congress Chronicling America Newspaper Archive, <http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn83030213/1855-02-23/ed-1/seq-7.pdf>

Document Author, Title, Date	What is the Document About?	Point of View of Author	Similarities between Perspectives of Authors	Differences between Perspectives of Authors

Reflection: Answer the following questions in at least one complete sentence.

1. What information gave you insight into the historical context at the time of Elizabeth Jennings's trolley ejection and lawsuit?
2. How did you feel after reading these documents? What connections can you make to the Jennings event and lawsuit?
3. After reading these documents, do you think it is ever O.K. to break a rule or a law? Explain.

NEW-YORK DAILY TRIBUNE, WEDNESDAY, JULY 19, 1854.

OUTRAGE UPON COLORED PERSONS.

At a public meeting held in pursuance of due notice given of the colored citizens of the City and County of New-York, in the First Colored American Congregational Church, in Sixth-st., near the Bowery, for the purpose of making an expression of public sentiment condemnatory of the outrage committed upon the person of Miss Elizabeth Jennings, a highly respectable female, (who is employed as a teacher in the male department of one of the public schools in this City; also organist in the above-named church, in Sixth-st.,) while on her way to church on Sabbath afternoon, July 16, when she was most brutally outraged and insulted by a conductor of one of the Third-av. City cars.

The meeting was called to order, whereupon the Rev. LEVIN TILMON was appointed Chairman and P. S. Ewell, Secretary.

The Chairman stated the object of the assembly, after which the Rev. James Vickers of New-York addressed the meeting, and made a very elaborate speech appropriate to the occasion.

The Secretary then read a statement from Miss E. Jennings, which was presented in writing, she being unable to attend the meeting, owing to the injuries received at the hands of the railroad conductor and his abetors. The statement is as follows:

Sarah E. Adams and myself walked down to the corner of Pearl and Chatham sts. to take the Third-av. cars; I held up my hand to the driver and he stopped the cars; we got on the platform, when the conductor told us to wait for the next car; I told him I could not wait, as I was in a hurry to go to church, (the other car was about a block off;) he then told me that the other car had my people in it, that it was appropriated for that purpose; I then told him I had no people; it was no particular occasion; I wished to go to church, as I had been going for the last six months, and I did not wish to be detained; he insisted upon my getting off the car; I told him I would wait on the car until the other car came up; he again insisted on my waiting in the street, while I did not get off the car; by this time the other car came up, and I asked the driver if there was any room in his car; he told me very distinctly, "No, that there was more room in my car than there was in his;" yet this did not satisfy the conductor; he still kept driving me out or off of the car; said he had as much time as I had and could wait just as long; I replied, "Very well, we'll see;" he waited some few minutes, when the drivers becoming impatient, he said to me, "Well, you may go in, but remember, if the passengers raise any objections you shall go out, whether or no, or I'll put you out;" I answered again and told him I was a respectable person, born and raised in New-York, did not know where he was born, that I had never been insulted before while going to church, and that he was a good for nothing impudent fellow for insulting decent persons while on their way to church; he then said

colored persons want to ride they go to church, and then said I should come out and he would put me out; I told him not to lay his hands on me; he took hold of me and I took hold of the window sash and held on; he pulled me until he broke my grasp and I took hold of his coat and held on to that, he also broke my grasp from that, (but previously he had dragged my companion out, she all the while screaming for him to let go;) he then ordered the driver to fasten his horses, which he did, and come and help him put me out of the car; they then both seized hold of me by the arms and pulled and dragged me flat down on the bottom of the platform, so that my feet hung one way and my head the other, nearly on the ground. I screamed murder with all my voice, and my companion screamed out "you'll kill her; don't kill her;" the driver then let go of me and went to his horses; I went again in the car, and the conductor said you shall sweat for this; then told the driver to drive as fast as he could and not take another passenger in the car; to drive until he saw an officer or a Station House; they got an officer on the corner of Walker and Bowery, whom the conductor told that his orders from the agent were to admit colored persons if the passengers did not object, but if they did, not to let them ride; when the officer took me there were some eight or ten persons in the car; when the officer, without listening to anything I had to say, thrust me out, and then pushed me, and tauntingly told me to get redress if I could; this the conductor also told me, and gave me some name and number of his car; he wrote his name Moss and the car No. 7, but I looked and saw No. 6 on the back of the car; after dragging me off the car he drove me away like a dog, saying, not to be talking there and raising a mob or fight; I came home down Walker-st., and a German gentleman followed, who told me he saw the whole transaction in the street as he was passing; his address is Latour, No. 148 Pearl-st., bookseller; when I told the conductor I did not know where he was born, he answered, "I was born in Ireland;" I made answer it made no difference where a man was born, that he was none the worse or better for that, provided he behaved himself and did not insult genteel persons.

I would have come up myself, but am quite sore and stiff from the treatment I received from those monsters in human form yesterday afternoon. This statement I believe to be correct, and it is respectfully submitted.

ELIZABETH JENNINGS.

Mr. JEREMIAH POWERS next addressed the meeting. Remarks were then made by the Rev. L. TILMON and others, after which the following resolutions were unanimously adopted:

1. Resolved, That we regard such conduct as intolerant, in a civil and religious point of view, and that it calls for the reprehension of the respectable portion of the community.
2. Resolved, That there be a committee of five appointed to ascertain all the facts in the case, and if possible, bring the whole affair before the legal authorities; and that we demand at the hands of the proprietors, or colored citizens, the equal right to the accommodation of "transit" in the cars, so long as we possess the regular qualifications.
3. Resolved, That the above resolutions be forwarded and printed in THE NEW YORK TRIBUNE and Frederick Douglass's paper.

The meeting then adjourned, subject to call of Committee.

Document #2: "Court Record, Circuit Court Before Judge Rockwell," *The Brooklyn Daily Eagle*, February 23, 1855. The Brooklyn Public Library Digital Archive, <https://bklyn.newspapers.com/image/50244622/?terms=Elizabeth%2Bjennings>

Document #3: "A Wholesome Verdict," *New York Daily Tribune*, February 23, 1855, 7:4. The Library of Congress Chronicling America Newspaper Archive, <http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn83030213/1855-02-23/ed-1/seq-7.pdf>

TRANSCRIPT

COURT RECORD
Circuit Court
BEFORE JUDGE ROCKWELL.

February 22.

Elizabeth Jennings vs. The Third avenue Railroad Company.—The plaintiff is a colored lady, a teacher in one of the public schools, and the organist in one of the churches in New York. She got upon one of the Company's cars last summer, on the Sabbath, to ride to church. The conductor finally undertook to get her off, first alleging the car was full, and when that was shown to be untrue, he pretended the other passengers were displeased at her presence; but as she saw nothing of that, and insisted on her rights, he took hold of her by force to expel her. She resisted, they got her down on the platform, jammed her bonnet soiled her dress, and injured her person. Quite a crowd gathered around, but she effectually resisted, and they were not able to get her off. Finally, after the car had gone on further, they got the aid of a policeman, and succeeded in getting her from the car. She instructed her attorneys, Messrs. Culver, Parker and Arthur, to prosecute the Company, together with the driver and conductor. The two latter interposed no defense, the Company took issue, and the cause was yesterday brought to trial. Judge Rockwell charged, instructing the Jury that the Company were liable for the acts of their agents, whether committed carelessly and negligently, or willfully and maliciously. That they were common carriers, and as such bound to carry all respectable persons; that colored persons, if sober, well-behaved, and free from disease, had the same rights as others; and could neither be excluded by any rules of the Company, nor by force or violence; and in case of such expulsion or exclusion, the Company was liable.

The plaintiff claimed \$500 in her complaint; and the Jury agreed on \$225, on which the Court added ten percent besides the costs.

COURT RECORD.

Circuit Court,
BEFORE JUDGE ROCKWELL.

February 22.

Elizabeth Jennings vs. The Third avenue Railroad Company.—The plaintiff is a colored lady, a teacher in one of the public schools, and the organist in one of the churches in New York. She got upon one of the Company's cars last summer, on the Sabbath, to ride to church. The conductor finally undertook to get her off, first alleging the car was full, and when that was shown to be untrue, he pretended the other passengers were displeased at her presence; but as she saw nothing of that, and insisted on her rights, he took hold of her by force to expel her. She resisted, they got her down on the platform, jammed her bonnet soiled her dress, and injured her person. Quite a crowd gathered around, but she effectually resisted, and they were not able to get her off. Finally, after the car had gone on further, they got the aid of a policeman, and succeeded in getting her from the car. She instructed her attorneys, Messrs. Culver, Parker and Arthur, to prosecute the Company, together with the driver and conductor. The two latter interposed no defence, the Company took issue, and the cause was yesterday brought to trial. Judge Rockwell charged, instructing the Jury that the Company were liable for the acts of their agents, whether committed carelessly and negligently, or willfully and maliciously. That they were common carriers, and as such bound to carry all respectable persons; that colored persons, if sober, well-behaved, and free from disease, had the same rights as others; and could neither be excluded by any rules of the Company, nor by force or violence; and in case of such expulsion or exclusion, the Company was liable.

The plaintiff claimed \$500 in her complaint; and the Jury agreed on \$225, on which the Court added ten percent besides the costs.

NEW-YORK DAILY TRIBUNE, FRIDAY, FEBRUARY 23, 1855.

CITY ITEMS.

A WHOLESOME VERDICT.—The case of Elizabeth Jennings vs. the Third-av. Railroad Company, was tried yesterday in the Brooklyn Circuit, before Judge Rockwell. The plaintiff is a colored lady, a teacher in one of the public schools, and the organist in one of the churches in this City. She got upon one of the Company's cars last summer, on the Sabbath, to ride to church. The conductor finally undertook to get her off, first alleging the car was full, and when that was shown to be false, he pretended the other passengers were displeased at her presence; but as she saw nothing of that, and insisted on her rights, he took hold of her by force to expel her. She resisted, they got her down on the platform, jammed her bonnet, soiled her dress, and injured her person. Quite a crowd gathered around, but she effectually resisted, and they were not able to get her off. Finally, after the car had gone on further, they got the aid of a policeman, and succeeded in getting her from the car. She instructed her attorneys, Messrs. Culver, Parker and Arthur, to prosecute the Company, together with the driver and conductor. The two latter interposed no defense, the Company took issue, and the cause was yesterday brought to trial. Judge Rockwell gave a very clear and able charge, instructing the Jury that the Company were liable for the acts of their agents, whether committed carelessly and negligently, or willfully and maliciously. That they were common carriers, and as such bound to carry all respectable persons; that colored persons, if sober, well-behaved, and free from disease, had the same rights as others; and could neither be excluded by any rules of the Company, nor by force or violence; and in case of such expulsion or exclusion, the Company was liable.

The plaintiff claimed \$500 in her complaint, and a majority of the Jury were for giving her the full amount; but others maintained some peculiar notions as to colored people's rights, and they finally agreed on \$225, on which the Court added ten per cent. besides the costs.

Railroads, steamboats, omnibuses, and ferry-boats will be admonished from this, as to the rights of respectable colored people. It is high time the rights of this class of citizens were ascertained, and that it should be known whether they are to be thrust from our public conveyances, while German or Irish women, with a quarter of mutton or a load of codfish, can be admitted.

Learning Activity #4: Synthesizing Primary and Secondary Sources

Have students synthesize evidence from primary and secondary sources to write either a first- or third-person narrative. The narrative should demonstrate how the perspectives of those involved in Jennings's fight contribute to understandings of the role ordinary citizens played in the Long Civil Rights Movement in the United States. The formative performance task can be completed either individually or collaboratively where students cite evidence from the documents to address how the perspectives of a person involved in Jennings's ordeal connect to broader issues of abolition and emancipation in the antebellum era.

Assignment Choice #1: Third Person Narrative, Reporting Breaking News!

Directions: First, complete the chart below using the information from your secondary sources. Next, use the information from the primary and secondary sources to create your front-page newspaper article about Elizabeth Jennings's trolley expulsion and court case. Your front-page newspaper article will include the following:

- Title of your newspaper
- Title of your article
- Date of newspaper
- The article that is at least 1 paragraph in length
- Cite examples from at least 3 sources (two DBQs, one secondary source article)
- A picture with caption

Assignment Choice #2: First Person Narrative Writing an Eyewitness Account

Directions: Use the information from the primary and secondary sources to write a first-person narrative from the perspective of Elizabeth Jennings or a person involved in her trolley ejection or case. Use this template to help you write this first-person account.

Choose a Type of First-Person Narrative to Write:

- Diary entry
- Journal entry
- Op-ed in a newspaper article
- A letter
- An internal monolog (a conversation with oneself)
- An interview
- Another idea you have for a first-person narrative

Examples of a Perspective to Write from:

- Elizabeth Jennings
- Thomas L. Jennings
- Chester A. Arthur
- Judge Rockwell
- Moss, The Streetcar Conductor
- The Witness to Elizabeth's Ordeal
- A Juror who agreed to give Elizabeth Jennings her full settlement
- A Juror who disagreed to give Elizabeth Jennings her full settlement
- Another person not included in this list

Learning Activity #5: Debrief, Inquire, Make Connections

Students can share their first or third-person narratives and write a proposal to address how to commemorate a historical figure. This summative performance task not only outlines how students can apply what they learned about Elizabeth Jennings through engagement in historical empathy pedagogies, but also encourages inquiry for future lessons concerning civil rights and social justice in United States history.¹⁴ Ideas for student-led projects include creating infographic flyers, recording documentary videos, constructing informative websites, hosting podcasts, painting murals, composing songs, and writing letters to elected officials.

Conclusion

Elizabeth Jennings's bold actions on that 1854 summer morning had a profound impact on civil rights and the Black freedom movement in the United States. Implementing historical empathy pedagogies centered around source analysis related to this event can be an impactful way to engage students in analyzing the ways that ordinary citizens participated in movements for

equality. While Jennings is a historical figure from New York, teachers can adapt and teach these learning activities by engaging students in researching their own community's history to identify historical contexts, examine perspectives of historical figures, and analyze how their predecessors agitated, advocated, sacrificed, and persisted in challenging inequities. ■



Understanding Islam and Muslims
Dar al Islam is pleased to offer our 33rd annual residential Teachers' Institute
June 19 - July 2, 2022 in Abiquiu, New Mexico

Participants will learn about the depth and breadth of Islamic faith, practice, history and culture from university-level content experts. Participants will also engage with curricular resources to teach about Islam in social studies, religion or world history classes. Finally, participants will utilize Institute materials and collaborate on a final project that lends itself to immediate use in their classrooms.

The Teachers' Institute is FREE!! Participants pay their round trip travel expenses to Albuquerque, New Mexico. Dar al Islam provides books and supplementary materials, on-site room and board, and transportation between our campus in Abiquiu and the Albuquerque International Airport.

Apply Now! Applications are accepted on a rolling basis until May 15th with priority given to those submitted by April 1st. While the focus of this Institute is on secondary education, we accept and consider applications from a diversity of professionals.

For more information visit us online at www.daralislam.org. If you have any questions, contact us at InstituteDirector@daralislam.org.

Notes

1. Elizabeth Jennings, "Outrage Upon Colored Persons," *New York Daily Tribune* (July 19, 1854), 7: 2. The Library of Congress Chronicling America Newspaper Archive: <http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn83030213/1854-07-19/ed-1/seq-7.pdf>.
2. Ibid.
3. Ibid.
4. Circuit Court before Judge Rockwell, *The Brooklyn Daily Eagle* (February 22, 1855), The Brooklyn Public Library Digital Archive <https://bklyn.newspapers.com/image/50244622/?terms=Elizabeth%2Bjennings>
5. Ibid.
6. John H. Hewitt, "Search for Elizabeth Jennings, Heroine of a Sunday Afternoon in New York City," *New York History* 71, no. 4, (1990): 387.
7. Charles H. Withers, Andrea Reidell, and Kimberlee Ried, "The Stewart Sisters v. The Steamer Sue: Nineteenth-Century Black Female Activism," *Social Education* 85, no. 1 (2020): 30.
8. James L. Endacott and Sarah E. Brooks, "An Updated Theoretical and Practical Model for Promoting Historical Empathy," *Social Studies Research and Practice* 8, no. 1 (Spring 2013): 55.
9. Sherri R. Colby, "Energizing the History Classroom: Historical Narrative Inquiry and Historical Empathy," *Social Studies Research and Practice* 3, no. 3 (Winter 2008): 61.
10. National Council for the Social Studies, *The College, Career, and Civic Life (C3) Framework for Social Studies State Standards: Guidance for Enhancing the Rigor of K-12 Civics, Economics, Geography, and History* (Silver Spring, MD: NCSS, 2013), 6.
11. Diane L. Cunningham, "An Empirical Framework for Understanding How Teachers Conceptualize and Cultivate Historical Empathy in Students," *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 41, no. 5 (2009): 694.
12. Katherine A. Perrotta, "More than a Feeling: A Study on Conditions that Promote Historical Empathy in Middle and Secondary Social Studies Classes with 'The Elizabeth Jennings Project.'" Dissertation, Georgia State University (2016), 250. https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/mse_diss/41
13. Kathy Swan, John Lee, and S.G. Grant, *Inquiry Design Model: Building Inquiries in Social Studies* (National Council for the Social Studies, 2018).
14. Rada Abdo, "10+ Project Based Learning Examples for Educators," *Vennngage*, <https://venngage.com/blog/project-based-learning-examples>.

References

- Anderson, Beth. *Lizzie Demands a Seat! Elizabeth Jennings Fights for Streetcar Rights*. New York: Calkins Creek, 2004.
- Barton, Keith and Levstik, Linda S. *Teaching History for the*

Common Good. Mahwah, New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc, 2004.

- Brooks, Sarah. "Historical Empathy as Perspective Recognition and Care in One Secondary Social Studies Classroom." *Theory and Research in Social Studies Education* 39, no. 2. (2011): 166–202.
- Buchanan, Lisa B. "From Freedom Riders to the Children's March: Civil Rights Documentaries as Catalysts for Historical Empathy." *Social Education* 78, no.2 (March/April 2014): 91–95.
- Colby, Sherri R. "Contextualization and Historical Empathy: Seventh-Graders' Interpretations of Primary Documents." *Curriculum and Teaching Dialogue* 12, no.1 & 2 (2010): 69–83.
- Douglass, Frederick. "Legal Rights Vindicated." *Frederick Douglass' Paper*. (March 2, 1855).
- Endacott, Jason L. and Sarah Brooks. "Historical Empathy: Perspectives and Responding to the Past," in *The Wiley International Handbook of History Teaching and Learning*. Metzger, Scott A. and Lauren McArthur Harris (eds.), pp. 203–226. John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2018.
- Hearth, Amy H. *Streetcar to Justice: How Elizabeth Jennings Won the Right to Ride in New York*. New York: Greenwillow Books, 2018.
- Kohlmeier, Jada. "Couldn't She Just Leave? The Relationship Between Consistently Using Class Discussions and the Development of Historical Empathy in a 9th Grade World History Course." *Theory and Research in Social Education* 34, no. 1 (2006), 34–57.
- Middleton, Tracy. "From Past to Present: Taking Informed Action." *Social Education* 80, no. 6 (2016): 362–364.
- Mikorenda, Jerry. *America's First Freedom Rider: Elizabeth Jennings, Chester A. Arthur, and the Early Fight for Civil Rights* (Lyons Press, 2020).
- Perrotta, Katherine A. "A Study of Students' Social Identities and a Historical Empathy Gap in Middle and Secondary Social Studies Classes with the Instructional Unit 'The Elizabeth Jennings Project.'" *Curriculum and Teaching Dialogue* 20, no. 1 & 2 (2018): 53–69.
- Perrotta, Katherine A. and Bohan, Chara H. (2013). Nineteenth century Rosa Parks? Assessing Elizabeth Jennings' Legacy as a Teacher and Civil Rights Pioneer in Antebellum America. *Vitae Scholasticae: The Journal of Educational Biography* 30, no. 2, 5–23.
- Sassi, Laura. "Elizabeth Jennings Takes a Stand," *Highlights* 62, no. 1 (2007): 31–33.



Katherine Perrotta is Assistant Professor of Middle Grades and Secondary Education at Mercer University in Atlanta, Georgia. She can be reached at Perrotta_ka@mercer.edu.